Meaning Equivalence and Shift of Noun Phrases in Bilingual Children’s Literature; Indonesian into English Translation

Sari Puspita Dewi

Politeknik Negeri Jakarta, Depok, Indonesia
E-mail: sari.puspitadewi@grafika.pnj.ac.id

Abstract—The study aims at describing the equivalence and shift occurring in translating noun phrases. Library research was applied to this study. The data were taken from two bilingual picture books entitled Princess Mui Zee written by Firma Sutan, Princess Barruna written by Shinta Handini and their translation into Indonesian by Asih Gandana as the translator. The result of the study shows that the meaning equivalence often occurs in formal correspondence. Then, the study also finds the structure shift existed in 15 NPs of both stories; the class shift occurred in 3 NPs of both series; the unit shift happened in 1 NP of both series and the intra-system shift occurred in 2 NPs.

Keywords—translation; equivalence; shift; noun phrase.

I. INTRODUCTION

There are many ways to introduce a religious value to children; one of them is through stories. In Indonesia, several publishing houses provide religious stories in a form of picture books, and some of them are bilingual; Islamic Princess series by Mizan Publishing House for example. The series claim that by providing texts of each page in Bahasa Indonesia and in English language it can develop readers’ lingual competence.

The Cambridge Advanced Learner’s Dictionary (2008) defines picture book as “a book, especially for young children, which has a lot of pictures and not many words”. From this definition, a picture book has small amount of writing on a page full of images. These characteristics make picture book challenging for the translator in translating them. It was tough work for the translators in searching for the appropriate equivalence in a way of the culture and language gap.

The equivalence between the Source Language (SL) and Target Language (TL) is very significant to consider in translation work. Translators have to deliver accurately the structure and the content in the original text without any deliberate structured transformations (Saule, 2014). If the translator changes some details in the structure of the text, it can be done only in order to convey the original content better (Gasparov, 2001). The changes occurring in translation process are called shift. It can change grammatical categories; structure, unit and class. The aim of the shift is to make the meaning equivalence more natural (Fitriyani, 2017).

Islamic Princess series were chosen because there are many NP since stories describe places and situations which the princesses experienced. Therefore, this study focuses on meaning equivalence and shift in the Noun Phrases. What equivalences of noun phrases are found in the translation of Islamic Princess series? What types of shift occur in the translation of Islamic Princess series? There are six books in the series, but this research only focuses on two stories; Princess Mui Zee and Princess Barruna as the corpus.

II. LITERATURE REVIEW
An easy way to comply with the conference In previous studies, the meaning equivalences and shifts were analysed from English language into Indonesian language in a scope of semantics and syntax using Catford approach. Nur Hasanah (2012) found shifts on modality, subject and predicate in novel Eclipse and its translation Gerhana, while Fitriyani (2017) found shifts on Noun Phrases in The House On Hope Street and its translation Serpih- Serpih Harapan.

Catford had a preference for a more linguistic-based approach to translation and this approach is based on the linguistic work of Firth and Halliday (Leonardi, 2000). His main contribution in the field of translation theory is the introduction of the concepts of types and shifts of translation. Catford proposed very broad types of translation in terms of three criteria:

1. The extent of translation (full translation vs partial translation);
2. The grammatical rank at which the translation equivalence is established (rank-bound translation vs. unbounded translation);
3. The levels of language involved in translation (total translation vs. restricted translation).

The study refers only to the second type of translation, since this is the one that concerns the concept of equivalence, and it then moves on to analyse the notion of translation shifts, as elaborated by Catford, which are based on the distinction between formal correspondence and textual equivalence.

As far as translation shifts are concerned, Catford defines them as ‘departures from formal correspondence in the process of going from SL to the TL’ (Catford, 1965). Catford argues that there are two main types of translation shifts, namely level shifts, where the SL item at one linguistic level (e.g. grammar) has a TL equivalent at a different level (e.g. lexis), and category shifts which are divided into four types:

1. Structure-shifts, which involve a grammatical change between the structure of the ST and that of the TT;
2. Class-shifts, when a SL item is translated with a TL item which belongs to a different grammatical class, i.e. a verb may be translated with a noun;
3. Unit-shifts, which involve changes in rank;
4. Intra-system shifts, which occur when SL and TL possess systems which approximately correspond formally as to their constitution, but when translation involves selection of a non-corresponding term in the TL system’. For instance, when the SL singular becomes a TL plural

III. METHOD

All Library research was applied to this study. The data of this study were taken from two bilingual picture books entitled Princess Mui Zee written by Firma Sutan, Princess Barruna written by Shinta Handini and their translation into Indonesian by Asih Gandana as the translator.

The qualitative and descriptive method was used to analyse the data. The data were analysed, then, they were presented to describe the results. The table was used in presenting and describing the data. The tables contain the data from the SL and the TL to show the equivalences and to compare the English. NP and Indonesian NP to find the shift that may occur. The data analysis used Catford’s approach to translation equivalence.

IV. FINDINGS AND DISCUSSION

A. Meaning Equivalence of Noun Phrases

1) Formal Correspondence. Formal correspondence is any TL category (unit, class, structure, structural elements) which can be said to occupy, as close as possible, the same place in the in SL. As shown in Table 1 and 2 below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>S</th>
<th>T</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1</td>
<td>Setiap musim panas, <strong>berbagai perlombaan</strong> diadakan. (p.5)</td>
<td>Every summer, <strong>various competitions</strong> were held. (p.6)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
2. Dan akhirnya, mereka menemukan **sang Raja.** (p.20)  
And finally, they found the **King.** (p.21)

The Indonesian NP in the sentence number 1 is *berbagai perlombaan*. The phrase is translated into various competition in English NP. The structure in Indonesian NP is Quantifier + Noun (Head). The same thing happens also in English NP translation.

In the sentence number 2, the Indonesian NP is *sang Raja*. The phrase is translated into *the King* in English NP. The structure in both SL NP and TL NP is Determiner + Noun (Head).

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>SL</th>
<th>TL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Princess Barruna menciptakan <em>beberapa tarian.</em> (p.12)</td>
<td>Princess Barruna created <strong>some dances.</strong> (p.12)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>“.... Ini sedikit bantuan dari kami untuk meringankan biaya sekolah Nayala. Silakan diterima!” kata Princess Barruna. (p.20)</td>
<td>“.... This is a little help from us to lessen your burden to pay Nayala’s school fees. Please accept it!” said Princess Barruna with a smile. (p.20)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

The SL NP is *beberapa tarian*. The phrase is translated into *some dances* in English NP. The structure in both SL NP and TL NP is Quantifier + Noun (Head).

2) **Textual Equivalence.** Textual equivalence refers to the equality between the SL text and TL text in terms of information and cohesion.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>S</th>
<th>T</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td><strong>biaya sekolah</strong> Nayala, but the translation is different in TL NP. In the sentence number 1, <strong>biaya sekolah</strong> Nayala is translated into Nayala’s schooling. On the other hand, in the sentence number 2, it is translated into <strong>Nayala’s school fees</strong>.</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In KBBI (2015), *biaya* means an amount of money spent to have a service, and *sekolah* means an institution where people study. So in this case *biaya sekolah* means some money for school service. According to the Cambridge Advanced Learner’s Dictionary (2008), *schooling* means education at school, while *fee* is an amount of money paid for a particular right or service, in this case; school service.

Based on the definition above, *Nayala’s school fees* is the closest meaning to *biaya sekolah* Nayala translation.
B. Category Shift of Noun Phrase

1) Structure Shift. Structure shift is defined as the change of grammatical structure between the SL and the TL. The structure shift occurs when structure arranges them differently from SL into TL. As shown in the table below:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>SL</th>
<th>TL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Princess Mui Zee memiliki kulit yang putih bersih dan mata yang sipit. (p.3)</td>
<td>Princess Mui Zee had a clear fair skin and narrow eyes. (p.3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Princess Mui Zee memiliki kulit yang putih bersih dan mata yang sipit. (p.3)</td>
<td>Princess Mui Zee had a clear fair skin and narrow eyes. (p.3)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>3.</td>
<td>“... kenapa sih, Princess Mui Zee sangat menyayangi keledai jek itu? Lihat! Larinya saja sangat lamban. ...” (p.8)</td>
<td>“... why does Princess Mui Zee care about that ugly donkey? Look! He runs very slowly. ...” (p.8)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

In sentence number 1, the SL NP kulit yang putih bersih is translated into a clear fair skin. The head of SL NP is kulit as the initial position with the structure of N (head) + Adj (modifier) + Adj (modifier) + Adj (modifier), while the head of TL NP is as the final position with the structure of Adj (modifier) + N (head). Therefore, structure shift occurs from N (head) + Adj (modifier) + Adj (modifier) + Adj (modifier) + N (head). It also means that the head-initial in SL NP is shifted into the head-final TL NP.

In sentence number 3, the SL NP keledai jek itu is translated into that ugly donkey. The head of SL NP is keledai as the initial position with the structure of N (head) + Adj (modifier) + Adj (demonstrative), while the head of TL NP is as the final position. Hence, structure shift occurs from N (head) + Adj (modifier) + Adj (demonstrative) to Adj (demonstrative) + Adj (modifier) + N (head). It means that the head-initial in SL NP is shifted into the head-final TL NP.

As seen in Table 4, the sentence in Table 5 also has a structure shift and it is shown by the example of aula istana which aula is as the initial-position head. The shift occurs from N (head) + Adj (modifier) to Adj (determiner) + Adj (modifier) + N (head) structure.

2) Class Shift. Class shift exists when a SL item is translated with a TL item which belongs to a different grammatical class, i.e. a verb may be translated with a noun.

As seen in Table 5, the sentence in Table 6 also has a structure shift and it is shown by the example of aula istana which aula is as the initial-position head. The shift occurs from N (head) + Adj (modifier) to Adj (determiner) + Adj (modifier) + N (head) structure.

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>SL</th>
<th>TL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Setiap sore, Princess Barruna dan temannya belajar menari di aula istana. (p.4)</td>
<td>Every late afternoon, she and her friends learned dancing in the palace hall. (p.4)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

As seen in Table 6, the sentence in Table 7 also has a structure shift and it is shown by the example of aula istana which aula is as the initial-position head. The shift occurs from N (head) + Adj (modifier) to Adj (determiner) + Adj (modifier) + N (head) structure.

As seen in Table 7, the sentence in Table 8 also has a structure shift and it is shown by the example of aula istana which aula is as the initial-position head. The shift occurs from N (head) + Adj (modifier) to Adj (determiner) + Adj (modifier) + N (head) structure.

As seen in Table 8, the sentence in Table 9 also has a structure shift and it is shown by the example of aula istana which aula is as the initial-position head. The shift occurs from N (head) + Adj (modifier) to Adj (determiner) + Adj (modifier) + N (head) structure.

As seen in Table 9, the sentence in Table 10 also has a structure shift and it is shown by the example of aula istana which aula is as the initial-position head. The shift occurs from N (head) + Adj (modifier) to Adj (determiner) + Adj (modifier) + N (head) structure.
1. Nama Mui Zee diambil dari kata *mu’izz*, yang berarti memuliakan *makhluk Allah.* (p.3)

2. Suatu hari, Raja Zee Ah Li dalam perjalanan pulang ke *kerjaan tetangga.* (p.13)

The name Mui Zee was taken from the word *mu’izz,* which means honoring *Allah’s creatures.* (p.3)

One day, King Zee Ah Li was on his way back from his visit to *the neighboring kingdom.* (p.13)

The SL NP from sentence 1 is *makhluk Allah* which is translated into *Allah’s creature* in Indonesian NP. The SL NP has N (head) + N (modifier) structure, while the TL has Adj (possessive) + N (head) structure. Class shift occurs between these NPs because Noun word class changes into Adjective.

In sentence 2 class shift also occurs from Noun class to Adjective. The SL NP of *kerjaan tetangga* has N (head) + N (modifier) structure, while the TL NP of *the neighboring kingdom* has Adj (determiner) + Adj (modifier) + N (head) structure.

3) **Unit Shift.** Unit shift happens when the change of rank in the SL and it has different rank in the TL.

---

**TABLE VII**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>SL</th>
<th>TL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Setiap <em>musim panas,</em> berbagai perlombaan diadakan. (p.6)</td>
<td>Every <em>summer,</em> various competitions were held. (p.7)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Musim panas* is a Noun according to KBBI 2016 so the SL NP structure is N (head) + N (modifier). *Musim panas* becomes summer in English. It changes the component; *musim panas* is a Noun Phrase while *summer* is a word.

---

4) **Intra-system Shift.** It occurs when ‘SL and TL possess systems which approximately correspond formally as to their constituition, but when translation involves selection of a non-corresponding term in the TL system’. For instance, when the SL singular becomes a TL plural.

**TABLE VIII**

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>No.</th>
<th>SL</th>
<th>TL</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>1.</td>
<td>Princess Mui Zee memiliki kulit yang putih bersih dan <em>mata yang sipit.</em> (p.3).</td>
<td>Princess Mui Zee had a clear fair skin and <em>narrow eyes.</em> (p.3).</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>2.</td>
<td>Ketika raja dan rombongannya melewati <em>tebing berbatu</em> terjadilah longsoran batu (p.13)</td>
<td>When the king and his entourage passed a <em>rocky cliff,</em> a rockslide occurred (p.13)</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

*Mata yang sipit* is translated into *narrow eyes* in sentence 1. The intra-system shift occurs because *mata* as a singular noun becomes *eyes* as a plural one. Meanwhile, in sentence 2 the intra-system shift exists because the existence of Determiner as in *tebing berbatu* is translated into *a rocky cliff.* The structure of SL NP is N (head) + Adj (modifier) and the structure of TL NP is Adj (determiner) + Adj (modifier) + N (head).

Based on the data analysis, there were five NPs of formal correspondence found in Princess Mui Zee story, while only one NP in Princess Barruna story.

Then, the text equivalence only existed in Princess Barruna story as in *biaya sekolah Nayala* translated into two different NPs; *Nayala’s schooling* and *Nayala’s school fee.* It can be interpreted that the difference translation of *biaya sekolah Nayala* occurred because in Indonesian culture there is a paradigm that school is expensive, so even the school fee is free, people
still have to spend some amount of money to buy some school stuff such as books.

Next, the category shift is divided into four types; structure shift, class shift, unit shift and intra-system shift. First, structure shift was found in 10 NPs in Princess Mui Zee story, whereas only five NPs in Princess Barruna story. This happened because the difference between the structure of NP in SL and TL. In Bahasa Indonesia (Indonesian Language) the structure of NP is DM (Diterangkan Menerangkan) where the Noun is always as an initial-head. In contrast, in English language, the structure of NP consists of a final-head Noun together with adnominal. The adnominal position is located before the head of the NP. Some of adnominal are determiners, and noun adjunct.

Second, class shift was found in three NPs in Princess Mui Zee story, but it was not found in Princess Barruna story. It occurred in the changes of word classes from noun into adjective, noun into determiner, and noun into possessive modifier. Third, unit shift occurs when change in the rank in SL at different rank in the TL. In this study, unit shift occurred from phrase into word in Princess Mui Zee story.

The last, intra-system shift refers to the shift that occurs internally within the system. It was shown by the change of singular noun into plural noun. It was also shown by adding the determiner in the TL phrase which is not existed in TL phrase.

V. Conclusions

The equivalence between the Source Language (SL) and the Target Language (TL). (TL) is very important to consider in translation work. In this study, the meaning equivalence often occurs in formal correspondence. Then, in order to get the equal meaning in translation the shifts may occur. The result shows the structure shift existed in 15 NPs of both stories; the class shift occurred in 3 NPs of both series; the unit shift happened in 1 NP of both series and the intra-system shift occurred in 2 NPs.

References